

FY2025/2026 Local Government Funding Request

Draft Beach Project Assessment

Project Name	Smathers Beach Nourishment Project
Local Sponsor	City of Key West

Initial Assessment	8/23/2024
Group Assessment	8/26/2024
Draft Assessment	9/3/2024
Final Review	

Project Description
The Smathers Beach Nourishment Project is located at DEP monument V-412 along the Straits of Florida in the City of Key West in Monroe County. The 3000 ft long project has been nourished since the 1960s. The project has received six significant nourishments since with the most recent nourishment, including sand placement and dune repair, completed in 2023 to address damages from Hurricane Irma. Professional services have completed for engineering analyses, preparation of plans and specifications, physical and environmental surveys, and obtaining environmental permits. The requested funds are for completed placement of fill material and the construction of erosion control structures within the project area, as well as the monitoring phase to assess erosion and biological impacts post-construction. Staff have determined that 100% of the project is eligible for state cost sharing.

Funds will be used for (list project phase, specify which phase is reimbursement, if applicable)
Construction (2023 Beach Renourishment- Cost reimbursement for FY 24/25) and Monitoring (Yr 1 Monitoring- Cost reimbursement for FY24/25)

State cost share %	50.00%
--------------------	--------

Project Budget Table					
	State %	Federal	State	Local	Total
Feasibility	0.00%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Design	0.00%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Construction	50.00%	\$0	\$704,165.60	\$704,165.60	\$1,408,331.20
Year 1 Monitoring	50.00%	\$0	\$176,041.40	\$176,041.40	\$352,082.80
Year 2+ Monitoring	0.00%	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Total Project Costs		\$0	\$880,207.00	\$880,207.00	\$1,760,414.00

Federal cost share %	0.00%
Federal agency and description	N/A

TOTAL PROJECT SCORE (100 points)	35.4
---	------

Tier 1

Tourism-related impacts		
Return on investment (10 points)	Score	8.6

Local Sponsor: Project is requesting construction funds.

Department: Only projects requesting construction funds are eligible for the point.

Construction + Year 1 Monitoring Cost: \$880,207.00

Value: 241.3

Economic impact (10 points)	Score	10
------------------------------------	--------------	----

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department:

Monroe County, most current complete calendar data. Tourism-related sales tax data = \$212,366,572.07. County sales tax collections = \$333,895,349.00

Value: 63.6

Tier 2

Federal involvement

Federal authorization (5 points)	Score	0
---	--------------	---

Local Sponsor: Yes

Department: Verified only permit

Federal cost share (5 points)	Score	0
--------------------------------------	--------------	---

Local Sponsor: Yes 0%

Department: Verified

Federal funds available (5 points)	Score	0
---	--------------	---

Local Sponsor: No

Department: Verified

Storm damage reduction benefits

Current conditions (8 points)	Score	0
--------------------------------------	--------------	---

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: Beach nourishment was completed in August 2023 with no new survey received by the Department.

CEG calculated value: 0

Threat to upland development (2 points)	Score	0
--	--------------	---

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: CEG determined the project protects upland structures from a 25-year storm event.

CEG calculated value: 0

Value of upland property (5 points)	Score	1.4
-------------------------------------	-------	-----

Local Sponsor:

Department:

Calculated by GIS with 2023 data.

Total value:

\$565,943,821.00

Cost-effectiveness

Cost/volume/mile/year (10 points)	Score	1.9
-----------------------------------	-------	-----

Local Sponsor:

Sand placement vol = 20,760 cy; nourishment int = 5 years

Department:

Construction cost = \$1,408,331.20, volume = 20,760 cy, length = 0.57 mi,
nourishment interval = 5 yrs

Value:

23.8792

Enhanced longevity, dune addition, innovative technology, and regionalization (5 points)	Score	5
--	-------	---

Local Sponsor:

Enhanced Longevity, Dune Addition

Department:

Enhanced longevity and dune addition have been verified by the Department
and eligible for 5 points

Tier 3

Previous state commitment

Previously funded phases (1 point)	Score	1
------------------------------------	-------	---

Local Sponsor:

Yes

Department:

The department has previously provided cost-share on an approved
feasibility study or design phase for this project.

Total amount of previous funding (3 points)	Score	0.5
---	-------	-----

Local Sponsor:

N/A

Department:

Fiscal year 2015/2016 through 2024/2025

Total funds:

\$838,491.50

Previous partial appropriation (1 point)	Score	0
--	-------	---

Local Sponsor:

Yes

Department:

No partial appropriations in 3 previous fiscal year applications, not eligible
for the award of point.

Recreational benefits

Accessible beach area (2 points)	Score	0.5
----------------------------------	-------	-----

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: Calculated by CEG/GIS Staff
1993 Redesigned plan called for design berm width of 85 feet (x Project Length of 3,000 ft) Section 404 (b) Evaluation Report Monroe County Shore Protection Project 1993

Total area: 255,000

Recreational benefits (3 points)	Score	3
---	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: 70%

Department: Key West/Smathers Beach (3000 ft). Total 3000 ft/3000 ft= 100%

Percentage: 100%

Mitigation of inlet effects (5 points)	Score	0
---	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: Project is not within an area of inlet influence, therefore not eligible for the award of points.

CEG calculated value: 0

Volume/mile/year (5 points)	Score	0.5
------------------------------------	--------------	------------

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: Volume = 20,760 cy, Length = 3,000 ft,
Nourishment Interval = 5 yrs

CEG calculated value: 7,307.52

Tier 4

Successive unfunded requests (5 points)	Score	0
--	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: Yes (2+ yrs)

Department: Verified no successive unfunded requests. Not eligible for award of points.

Environmental habitat enhancement (5 points)	Score	0
---	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: The project is within a designated critical habitat area that is subject to extensive shoreline armoring.
Supporting documentation includes detailed design plans, lighting specifications, a construction schedule, and monitoring reports for exceeded best management practices of sea turtles.

Department: The project boundary intersects critical habitat area. The shoreline is 0% armored which is less than the 30% threshold. Therefore, the project is not eligible for the award of 3 points.

Overall readiness to proceed

Readiness to construct (1 point)	Score	0
---	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: N/A

Department: Ineligible for the award of additional point

Active permits (1 point)	Score	1
---------------------------------	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: State: 0129031-005-JC (exp 07/12/2028)
Fed: SAJ-1998-01677(SP-MLC) (exp 09/28/2027)

Department: Verified

Easements acquired (1 point)	Score	1
-------------------------------------	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: Yes

Department: Verified

Local funds secured (1 point)	Score	0
--------------------------------------	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: Yes, signed resolution submitted with application.

Department: Draft Resolution was not submitted for current year by application deadline.

Erosion Control Line established (1 point)	Score	1
---	--------------	----------

Local Sponsor: Yes

Department: Verified